



## MINUTES OF 9<sup>TH</sup> ECOSAI ASSEMBLY

26 AUGUST 2022 | NUR-SULTAN, KAZAKHSTAN

### List of Attached Documents

S. No	Document Title	Annexure Number
1.	List of Participants	I
2.	ECOSAI President Opening Speech	II
3.	Agenda of ECOSAI 9 <sup>th</sup> Assembly	III
4.	Activity Report by the Secretary-General ECOSAI	IV
5.	Triennial Accounts for the years 2019-22 and the Budget for the years 2022-24	V
6.	Audit Report on the ECOSAI Accounts for the period 1 January 2019 to 31 December 2022	VI
7.	21 <sup>st</sup> Training Committee Meeting Report	VII
8.	ECOSAI Training Plan 2023-25	VIII
9.	Closing speech	IX

\*\*\*\*\*

The 9<sup>th</sup> ECOSAI Assembly was held on 26 August 2022 in Nur-Sultan, Kazakhstan. Following ECOSAI members / Head of Delegations and Observers attended the meeting:

- I. Ms. Natalya Godunova, Chairwoman of the Accounts Committee for Control over Execution of the Republican Budget for the Republic of Kazakhstan & President ECOSAI.
- II. Mr. Metin Yener, President of the Turkish Court of Accounts.
- III. Mr. Muhammad Ajmal Gondal, Auditor General of Pakistan and Secretary-General ECOSAI.



- IV. Mr. Vugar Gulmammadov, Chairman Chamber of Accounts of the Republic of Azerbaijan.
- V. Mr. Almazbek Akmatov, Chairman Chamber of Accounts of the Kyrgyz Republic.
- VI. Mr. Osman Korahan, President Court of Audit of the Turkish Republic of Northern Cyprus.
- VII. Mr. Mehrdad Bazrpash, President of the Supreme Audit Court of Iran.
- VIII. His Excellency, Sheikh Fahad bin Hamad Al-Thani, Deputy President of the State Audit Bureau of the State of Qatar.
- IX. Mr. Vasily Gerasimov, Chairman of the State Control Committee of the Republic of Belarus.
- X. Mr. Iyad Mousa Tayem, Chairman of State Audit & Administrative Control Bureau of Palestine.
- XI. Mr. Abdulaziz Rakhmonov, Chief inspector of the Chamber of Accounts of Uzbekistan.

The complete list of participants is at Annexure-I.

### **1. Welcome speech and Opening of the Assembly**

Ms. Natalya Godunova, Chairwoman of the Accounts Committee for Control over Execution of the Republican Budget for the Republic of Kazakhstan / President of the ECOSAI welcomed the attendees and thanked them for their participation in the ECOSAI events. After delivering the opening speech the President declared to open the 9<sup>th</sup> ECOSAI Assembly session.

The opening speech of the President of the ECOSAI is placed at Annexure-II.

### **2. Adoption of Assembly Agenda**

President ECOSAI presented the proposed agenda of the 9<sup>th</sup> ECOSAI Assembly (Annexure-III) and the Assembly unanimously adopted the same.

### **3. Activity Report by the Secretary-General ECOSAI**

Mr. Muhammad Ajmal Gondal, Auditor General of Pakistan and Secretary-General ECOSAI presented the Activity Report of the ECOSAI for the last three years. At the outset, he appreciated the excellent arrangements by the SAI Kazakhstan for all the events of the ECOSAI. Secretary-General reassured the full support of the SAI Pakistan in attaining the aims, objectives and activities of the ECOSAI. He briefly gave an account of the training



activities, Status of signing of MoUs among member states and publication of ECOSAI Circulars for the last three years.

**Outcome:** Assembly unanimously approved the triennial Activity report presented by the Secretary-General. The triennial Activity report is placed at Annexure-IV.

#### **4. Presentation of the ECOSAI Triennial Accounts 2019-21 and Budget 2022-24**

Mr. Israr ul Haq, Director General, SAI Pakistan presented the triennial accounts for the years 2019-21. He further highlighted the important heads of receipt and expenditure in the Budget estimates for the next three years 2022-24 which are as follows:

- a. Triennial Accounts & Financial Statements comprising of Balance Sheet
- b. Statement of Income and Expenditure and Cash Flow Statement along with Explanatory Notes for Summary of triennial Contribution
- c. Accumulated Contribution Receipt & Expenditure there from and IDB Training Grants

**Outcome:** The triennial Accounts for the years 2019-21 and the Budget for the years 2022-24 were unanimously approved by the 9th ECOSAI Assembly placed at Annexure-V.

#### **5. Approval of the Audit Committee Report on the audit of the ECOSAI accounts to be presented by the SAIs of Iran and Kyrgyz**

SAI Iran and Kyrgyz prepared the Audit report of the ECOSAI Accounts from 1 January 2019 to 31 December 2021. Mr. Basheer Sadeghi of SAI Iran presented the draft audit report.

**Outcome:** Assembly unanimously approved the report of the Audit Committee placed at Annexure-VI

#### **6. Approval of the 21<sup>st</sup> ECOSAI Training Committee Report and its future plans**

SAI Pakistan/ ECOSAI Secretariat presented the Report of the 21<sup>st</sup> ECOSAI Training Committee held on 25 August 2022 (Annexure -VII).

**Outcome:** Assembly unanimously approved the 21<sup>st</sup> ECOSAI Training Committee report.



## 7. Approval of the ECOSAI Training Plan 2023-25

ECOSAI Secretariat apprised that SAI Iran, SAI Turkey, SAI Pakistan, SAI Kazakhstan and SAI Azerbaijan intended to host the ECOSAI trainings during 2023-25. ECOSAI Secretariat presented the Training Plan 2023-25 before ECOSAI Assembly.

**Outcome:** Assembly unanimously approved the Training Plan 2023-25 Annexure -VIII.

## 8. Report on MoUs signed between ECOSAI members SAIs

- i. SAI Pakistan presented the report on MoU signed between ECOSAI member SAIs. SAI Pakistan informed that 14th Training Committee Meeting in 2014 recommended a proposal of SAI Iran for exchange of visits of a small group of experts among the member SAIs through bilateral agreements (MoUs) which was approved by the Governing Board.
- ii. In pursuance of this decision, SAI Pakistan has signed MoUs with SAIs of Iran (2016), Turkey (2016) and Tajikistan (2018). SAI Iran has similar MoUs with SAIs of Turkey and Tajikistan. SAI Kazakhstan has signed MoU with SAI of Iran.
- iii. The Memorandum of Understanding was signed between SAI Tajikistan and SAI Afghanistan in Tajikistan, Dushanbe on 29.03.2021 and MoU was signed between SAI Tajikistan and SAI Uzbekistan in Tajikistan, Dushanbe 10.06.2021.
- iv. A Memorandum of Understanding was signed between SAI Turkey and SAI Uzbekistan, during the 160th anniversary Celebration program of the Turkish Court of Accounts on 31.05.2022.
- v. MoU between SAIs of Azerbaijan and Pakistan is under finalization.
- vi. SAI Azerbaijan has renewed the MoU with SAI Turkey in May 2022, in Baku, Azerbaijan.
- vii. Under the MoUs, several capacity building activities have been undertaken by the member SAIs. Training experts from SAI Pakistan delivered a three-week training course on Performance Auditing in Ankara, Turkey in 2018 for the personnel of TCA. SAI Pakistan provided services of an experienced Master Trainer to SAI Iran to impart a five-day course on Performance Auditing in 2019.
- viii. SAI Turkey invited SAI Pakistan to conduct the Peer Review of the Turkish Court of Accounts in the areas of its Independence and Mandate, Peer Review was conducted



by SAI Pakistan and its report was presented to President TCA electronically on September 16, 2020, which was acknowledged by President TCA.

**Outcome:** Assembly unanimously approved the report on the MoU between SAIs

#### 9. **Announcement of the new President of the ECOSAI**

SAI Azerbaijan and SAI Iran contested election for the position of ECOSAI President. After secret balloting both SAIs obtained five votes each. The Chairman Chamber of Accounts of the Republic of Azerbaijan showed grace and withdrawn in favour of SAI Iran to be the next President of ECOSAI.

**Outcome:** SAI Iran become new President of the ECOSAI.

#### 10. **Election of the new ECOSAI Governing Board and Audit Committee members**

ECOSAI Assembly was informed that the following member SAIs are willing to be the member of ECOSAI Governing Board for the next three years:

- a. SAI Kazakhstan
- b. SAI Turkey
- c. SAI Kyrgyz Republic

ECOSAI Assembly was for the following member SAIs willingness for their membership ECOSAI Audit Committee:

- a. SAI Uzbekistan
- b. SAI Tajikistan

**Outcome:** ECOSAI Assembly unanimously approved these nominations and appointed the above SAIs on the ECOSAI Governing Board and Audit Committee for the next three years.

#### 11. **Determination of the date and venue of the 10th ECOSAI Assembly**

The 10th ECOSAI Assembly will be held in Iran.



**12. Determination of venue of the next two Governing Board Meetings**

SAI Iran expressed willingness to hold the Governing Board meeting in Iran in 2023. SAI Kazakhstan showed willingness to host GBM in 2024.

**13. Speech by the new President of the ECOSAI**

Mr. Mehrdad Bazrpash, President of the Supreme Audit Court of Iran thanked all members SAIs for their support to become the President of ECOSAI. He also showed his commitment for achieving the aims and objectives of ECOSAI.

**14. Other matters**

ECOSAI Assembly supported the proposal of the Accounts Committee of Kazakhstan to postpone consideration of the issue of the blocked amount 18,000 US Dollars by the Office of Foreign Assets Control (OFAC) with regard to the Islamic Republic of Iran.

**15. Closing speech**

In her closing address Ms. Natalya Godunova, Chairwoman of the Accounts Committee for Control over Execution of the Republican Budget for the Republic of Kazakhstan expressed her deep appreciation to all the colleagues for their active participation in the discussion and in the decision making process placed at Annexure- IX.

Signed:



**(Ms. Natalya Godunova, Chairwoman of the Accounts Committee for Control over Execution of the Republican Budget for the Republic of Kazakhstan/ President ECOSAI)**

\*\*\*\*\*

